

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

TO BE FILED UNDER SEAL<sup>1</sup>

-against-

ORDER

KEITH RANIERE, also known as Vanguard,  
CLARE BRONFMAN, ALLISON MACK,  
KATHY RUSSELL, LAUREN SALZMAN,  
and NANCY SALZMAN, also known as Prefect,

18 Crim. 204 (NGG) (VMS)

Defendants.

VERA M. SCANLON, United States Magistrate Judge:

In the Court's Order dated April 6, 2019, ECF No. 505, the Court found that it did not have sufficient information to make a privilege determination as to one of the disputed emails, Index No. 190 (DOJ\_Bronfman\_Priv\_00002654). The subject email was sent by an attorney retained by [REDACTED], and the recipients were [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]. As described in Defendant Bronfman's privilege motion, [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]. The Court concluded that it did not have sufficient information to assess the impact that [REDACTED] inclusion on an otherwise intra-corporate email had on the claimed privilege, and invited

<sup>1</sup> Only the Court, Defendant Bronfman and her counsel, and the privilege review team may have access to this Order. A redacted public copy will be filed on the docket.

Defendant Bronfman to submit additional evidence. Defendant Bronfman made a supplemental submission on April 10, 2019. ECF No. 520.

The Court has reviewed the supplemental information submitted by Defendant Bronfman and concludes that [REDACTED] inclusion on the subject email did not destroy privilege. Defendant Bronfman submitted documentation of the administrative work that [REDACTED] performed [REDACTED]. Based on the information provided, [REDACTED] inclusion on the subject communication was consistent with the tasks she performed [REDACTED]. See, e.g., U.S. ex rel. Miller v. Bill Harbert Int'l Constr., Inc., No. 95 Civ. 1231 (RCL), 2007 WL 915235, at \*2-3 (D.D.C. March 27, 2007) (presence of client's assistant did not waive privilege when assistant's job was to witness documents and ensure a record of their creation).

Accordingly, the Court finds that the email at Index No. 190 is privileged and shall not be released any further.

Dated: April 12, 2019  
Brooklyn, New York

---

*Vera M. Scanlon*  
VERA M. SCANLON  
United States Magistrate Judge